



Provo City Planning Commission

Report of Action

July 10, 2019

*Item 3 The Provo City Community Development Department requests Code Amendments to Section 14.34.287 regarding the design standards for buildings in the Campus Mixed Use Zone. City-wide application. Josh Yost (801) 852-6408
PLOTA20190025

The following action was taken by the Planning Commission on the above described item at its regular meeting of July 10, 2019:

RECOMMEND APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS

On a vote of 7:0, the Planning Commission approved the above noted application, with the following conditions:

Conditions of Approval:

1. Amend Table 14.34.287-1 to read “1 per 30 feet (1 min.)” under Commercial for PBE’s Required for Each Street-facing façade and “40 feet” under Commercial for Maximum Spacing.
2. Insert the following paragraph into 14.34.287 as (2)(a)

All of the following requirements shall apply, unless the Planning Commission approves an alternative design arrangement equal to or better than the requirements set forth in this section. The Planning Commission shall make specific findings justifying the alternate design arrangement.

Motion By: Jamin Rowan

Second By: Russ Phillips

Votes in Favor of Motion: Jamin Rowan, Deborah Jensen, Robert Knudsen, Maria Winden, Russ Phillips, David Andersen, Andrew Howard

Deborah Jensen was present as Chair.

- Additional Report of Action for June 27, 2019, Item 4 was continued by the Planning Commission to July 10, 2019.
- Includes facts of the case, analysis, conclusions and recommendations outlined in the Staff Report, with any changes noted; Planning Commission determination is generally consistent with the Staff analysis and determination.

LEGAL DESCRIPTION FOR PROPERTY TO BE REZONED

Not applicable

RELATED ACTIONS

None

APPROVED/RECOMMENDED OCCUPANCY

Not applicable

APPROVED/RECOMMENDED PARKING

Not applicable

DEVELOPMENT AGREEMENT

Not applicable

PLANNING COMMISSION RECOMMENDED TEXT AMENDMENT

Recommended text amendment is attached to this staff report.

STAFF PRESENTATION

The Staff Report to the Planning Commission provides details of the facts of the case and the Staff's analysis, conclusions, and recommendations. Key points addressed in the Staff's presentation to the Planning Commission included the following:

- The recommended amendments are to correct deficiencies or strengthen weaknesses that have been identified in the current ordinance.
- Staff sought input from the development community and from the Design Review Committee.

Over a year ago, the setbacks for this zone were amended. At that time, staff said that additional, more substantive amendments would be presented to the City Council at a future date.

NEIGHBORHOOD MEETING DATE

- City-wide application; all Neighborhood Chairs received notification.

NEIGHBORHOOD AND PUBLIC COMMENT

- This item was City-wide or affected multiple neighborhoods. No public input was received.

PLANNING COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Key points discussed by the Planning Commission included the following:

- The Design Review Committee felt the door spacing for commercial uses may need to be increased. Staff has increased this.
- The Design Review Committee also voiced a concern over the rigid nature of some of the standards so staff added a provision to allow the Planning Commission latitude to alter or vary standards if the Planning Commission feels the final product is equal to or better than the baseline code requirement.

FINDINGS / BASIS OF PLANNING COMMISSION DETERMINATION **delete section if same as Staff Report**

The Planning Commission identified the following findings as the basis of this decision or recommendation:



Planning Commission Chair



Director of Community Development

See Key Land Use Policies of the Provo City General Plan, applicable Titles of the Provo City Code, and the Staff Report to the Planning Commission for further detailed information. The Staff Report is a part of the record of the decision of this item. Where findings of the Planning Commission differ from findings of Staff, those will be noted in this Report of Action.

Legislative items are noted with an asterisk (*) and require legislative action by the Municipal Council following a public hearing; the Planning Commission provides an advisory recommendation to the Municipal Council following a public hearing.

Administrative decisions of the Planning Commission (items not marked with an asterisk) **may be appealed** by submitting an application/notice of appeal, with the required application and noticing fees, to the Community Development Department, 330 West 100 South, Provo, Utah, **within fourteen (14) calendar days of the Planning Commission's decision** (Provo City office hours are Monday through Thursday, 7:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m.).

BUILDING PERMITS MUST BE OBTAINED BEFORE CONSTRUCTION BEGINS

EXHIBIT A

14.34.287 Residential Design Standards - Revisions

- 1 ...
- 2 2. Applicability. The design standards set forth in this Section shall apply to all new residential
3 buildings and uses located in the Low Density Residential, Medium Density Residential, High
4 Density Residential, Campus High Density Residential and Campus Mixed Use zones. In
5 approving a project plan, the approving authority may impose reasonable conditions consistent
6 with the purpose and intent of this Section. The requirements for this Section shall apply in
7 addition to other applicable requirements of this Title. This Section shall be interpreted to
8 supersede other requirements of the Provo City Code which may impose more restrictive
9 requirements.
- 10 a. All of the following requirements shall apply, unless the Planning Commission approves
11 an alternative design arrangement equal to or better than the requirements set forth in this
12 section. The Planning Commission shall make specific findings justifying the alternate
13 design arrangement.
- 14 3. ~~Yard~~ Site Design Standards.
- 15 a. Front Yards.
- 16 i. There shall be a logical hard surface pedestrian connection between the street and
17 the front entry.
- 18 ii. The front yard shall be predominantly landscaped with a combination of turf and
19 plants. Hard surfaces for driveways and parking shall be minimized and shall not
20 exceed ordinance requirements.
- 21 iii. Utility boxes shall not be located in the front or street side yards or park strips
22 unless the applicant demonstrates that there is no other practical location for
23 utility boxes on the site.
- 24 iv. Mediate between public and private space on residential frontages. This
25 requirement may be met with the following strategies.
- 26 1. Use foundation plantings to provide separation between residential units
27 and the sidewalk.
- 28 2. Design porches, stoops and railings to provide intermediate semi-private
29 spaces.
- 30 3. Employ elevation changes to delineate the progression from public space
31 through semi-private space into interior private space.
- 32 b. Fences.
- 33 i. Fences shall complement the architectural character of the project.
- 34 ii. Chain link fences shall be prohibited in front yards.
- 35 iii. Fencing shall conform to Section 14.34.500, Provo City Code.
- 36 4.c. Building Location.
- 37 a.i. New structures shall be sited consistently with the existing front setbacks of adjoining
38 properties to maintain neighborhood compatibility, with the exception of projects that
39 are zoned High Density Residential (HDR), Campus High Density Residential

(CHDR), or Campus Mixed Use (CMU), where the zone permits lesser setbacks than the existing housing stock.

ii. Frontage

1. A building's front elevation is the elevation whereon the primary or common entrance is located.
2. Buildings shall front on a street, open space, or pedestrian way.
3. Buildings shall not front an interior property boundary or parking lot.
4. In any development consisting of (5) or more townhomes each townhome shall front a street, open space or pedestrian way.

biii. The majority of new buildings in multifamily developments shall be sited along the block face rather than the interior of the block.

1. Interior lot development should comprise no more than twenty-five percent (25%) of a project's area.

ed. Buildings, including parking structures, shall be designed and located in a manner that allows planting and growth of mature trees in the front and side yards.

54. Building Facades.

a. Ground Floor Treatment

i. Commercial Ground Floors in the Campus Mixed Use Zone

1. Design ground floor commercial space for retail or other active uses, orienting tenant spaces to the street and maximizing storefronts and entries along the sidewalks to sustain street level interest and promote pedestrian traffic
2. Wall openings, such as storefronts, windows and doors, shall comprise at least 60% of a building's street level façade measured as a percentage of façade area between the ground plan and the finished floor elevation of the second floor.
3. Open-wall storefronts are encouraged.

ii. Ground floors in all applicable zones.

1. Excepting townhomes, a minimum habitable first floor depth of 30' as measured from the street facing façade is required.
2. Residential units with individual entries shall include windows on the ground floor that look out onto the street, with wall openings comprising at least 30% of the street level façade, measured as a percentage of façade area between the ground plan and the finished floor elevation of the second floor..
3. Clear glass for wall openings, i.e., doors and windows, shall be used along all street-level façades for maximum transparency. Tinted, mirrored or opaque glazing is not permitted for any required wall opening along street level façades
4. Articulation and detailing of the ground floor with pedestrian entrances, quality materials and decorative details, shall be used to promote pedestrian-scaled architecture along the street.
5. Electrical service, mechanical, or other equipment, enclosed stairs, storage spaces, blank walls, and other elements that are not pedestrian-

84 oriented shall not be located along the ground floor street wall unless
85 required by applicable code and no workable alternative location exists.

86 b. Pedestrian Building Entrances

87 i. Pedestrian building entrances shall

- 88 1. meet the spatial requirements set forth in Table 14.34.295-1
- 89 Pedestrian Building Entrance (PBE) Requirements;
- 90 2. contain a door providing direct pedestrian access into a building;
- 91 3. directly access an interior and enclosed commercial tenant space,
- 92 public lobby, or residential unit;
- 93 4. be directly accessible from and directly adjacent to the sidewalk;
- 94 and
- 95 5. prevent doors from swinging into the public right-of-way or
- 96 beyond the front façade line of the building when opened.

97 ii. Fire exit doors, doors to fire riser rooms or other mechanical spaces, and
98 doors to exterior courtyards shall not qualify as pedestrian building
99 entrances.

100 ~~a. All structures shall have at least one (1) primary unit entry that faces the street.~~

101 ~~Multifamily residential uses on corner lots shall have at least one (1) primary entry along~~
102 ~~each street frontage.~~

103 ~~b. Additional entrances may be located on side or rear facades.~~

104 c. The primary entrance of a multifamily structure shall be clearly defined by use of a raised
105 porch or other similar entry feature.

- 106 i. The front porch or entry feature shall be oriented to the street.
- 107 ii. The minimum size of the front porch or entry feature shall be functional rather than
- 108 merely decorative.
- 109 iii. The porch floor height shall not exceed thirty (30) inches above the elevation of
- 110 the top of the street curb.

111 d. Doors, windows and balconies of new housing should be located to respect the privacy of
112 neighboring properties.

Table 14.34.287-1 Pedestrian Building Entrance (PBE) Requirements		
Frontage Type	Commercial	Residential
PBE's Required for Each Street-facing Façade	1 per 30 feet (1 min.)	1 per street-fronting ground floor unit
Maximum Spacing	40 feet	38 feet

113 **65. Driveways and Parking.**

114 a. New developments shall provide the minimum amount of driveway access **and width**
115 required **by code** as a means of preserving front yard space.

116 a. Driveway placement ~~should~~ **shall** be toward the side property line to avoid
117 dividing a building by a single, central driveway to subterranean parking.
118

- 119 ii. Driveways shall be consolidated where adjacent parcels or developments can be
120 served by a single driveway. Cross access easements shall guarantee rights of
121 access across the shared driveway for both parcels.
- 122 ~~iii.~~ Alley access for properties ~~should~~ shall be encouraged to reduce the impact of
123 parking and traffic circulation on the front of the property.
- 124 ~~iii~~iv. Parking and interior access ~~should~~ shall be designed to minimize the number of
125 curb cuts.
- 126 b. Parking shall not be placed in the front yard and should be minimized in the ~~rear yard~~
127 side yard, with the exception of one- and two-family dwellings when the driveway leads
128 to a garage or carport as defined in Chapter 14.37, Provo City Code.
- 129 a. Parking shall not be allowed between a primary building and a public street.
- 130 b. Surface parking areas in rear yards shall be screened from neighboring properties
131 with appropriate plant materials and/or fencing.
- 132 c. Entrances to ~~underground~~ structured parking shall be provided from driveways
133 along the sides of properties, not from a front-facing ~~underground~~ garage entry;
134 ~~unless the applicant demonstrates that no alternative is feasible.~~
- 135 iv. Parking shall be screened from any adjacent public way, street, open space or
136 pedestrian way.
- 137 c. ~~Except for the minimum ground-level frontage required for access to parking and~~
138 ~~loading, no parking or loading shall be visible on the ground floor of any building façade~~
139 ~~that faces a public right-of-way. It is recognized that providing parking within the~~
140 ~~primary building may create a conflict with the desire for pedestrian connectivity~~
141 ~~at street level. An alternate design that includes parking on the main level of~~
142 ~~the building and on a facade that faces a public street may be approved by the Design~~
143 ~~Review Committee, subject to the following standards:~~
- 144 ~~a.—There shall be a significant, pedestrian entrance to the building at street level to~~
145 ~~maintain a pedestrian connection to the street;~~
- 146 ~~b.—A minimum of thirty percent (30%) of the primary street level building facade~~
147 ~~must be habitable floor space such as living space, rental office or amenity space;~~
- 148 ~~c.—The parking structure shall be treated with materials, windows, building relief and~~
149 ~~rhythm that mask the appearance of the parking structure. The~~
150 ~~parking structure shall be appear to be part of the residential or~~
151 ~~commercial building; and~~
- 152 ~~d. The Design Review Committee should consider aesthetic transitions at facade~~
153 ~~corners when a side elevation is viewable from a public street.~~

154 **76. Landscape Design.**

- 155 d. Property owners shall comply with Section 15.20.030, Provo City Code, for the
156 protection of existing vegetation.
- 157 e. New landscaping shall be complementary to existing neighborhood vegetation.
- 158 i. The species, size and placement of new landscaping shall be considered in the design
159 review process.
- 160 f. Landscaping shall be used to reduce the impact of larger buildings on neighboring
161 properties.

162 g. Buildings and driveway lighting should not extend beyond the boundaries of the subject
163 property, as per Chapter 15.21, Provo City Code.

164 **87. Building Form, Mass and Scale (LDR Zone Only).**

165 a. Building form, mass and scale should be appropriate for the zone in which the building is
166 located and consistent with the established neighborhood character.

167 i. Architectural elements such as roof form, windows, doors, etc., should be consistent
168 with the form and character of the existing housing in the area.

169 ii. A porch or similar element, which defines the front entrance, shall be provided.

170 iii. An attached garage shall not be the dominant design feature of the front elevation.

171 iv. Sloping roofs such as gable or hip design should be used as the primary roof form.

172 v. Historic buildings are subject to Title 16, Provo City Code.

173 b. Building additions shall not strongly alter the character of an original building.

174 i. Windows, materials and doors should be compatible with those of the
175 original building.

176 ii. Roof forms shall be compatible with the existing structure.

177 **98. Building Form, Mass and Scale (MDR, HDR, CHDR and CMU Zones).**

178 a. The facade of any multiple-family, ~~or~~ apartment, ~~or mixed use~~ structure shall: ~~have~~
179 ~~sufficient relief and rhythm to give visual interest and appeal.~~

180 i. ~~Be articulated in the horizontal plane to provide visual interest and enrich the~~
181 ~~pedestrian experience, while contributing to the quality and definition of the street~~
182 ~~wall.~~

183 ii. ~~Be vertically articulated to differentiate the ground floor façade, and feature high~~
184 ~~quality materials that add human scale, texture and variety at the pedestrian level.~~

185 iii. ~~Provide an identifiable break between the building's ground floors and upper floors.~~

186 ~~This break may include a change in material, horizontal dividing element, a change in~~
187 ~~fenestration pattern or similar means.~~

188 iv. ~~Be vertically articulated at the street wall façade, establishing different treatment for~~
189 ~~the building's base, middle and top. Use balconies, fenestration, shading devices, or~~
190 ~~other elements to create an interesting pattern of projections and recesses.~~

191 v. ~~Avoid extensive blank walls that detract from the experience and appearance of an~~
192 ~~active streetscape.~~

193 vi. ~~Provide well-marked entrances to cue access and use. Enhance all public entrances to~~
194 ~~a building or use through compatible architectural or graphic treatment.~~

195 ~~b. One (1) continuous roof line shall be avoided. Variation in the roof line, or roof height, is~~
196 ~~encouraged.~~

197 b. ~~Exterior stairways, corridors or landings shall not be located on the front or street side~~
198 ~~elevation of the building.~~

199 c. Structures located in the CHDR and CMU zones that are greater than ~~six~~~~four~~
200 ~~(64)~~ stories in height shall step back fifteen (15) feet from the first floor elevation for
201 all stories above the fourth floor on all elevations that front a public street unless the
202 applicant can demonstrate that there is sufficient variation and articulation in
203 the building planes to give visual interest and appeal.

204 d. Building additions shall not strongly alter the character of the original building.

205 i. Windows, materials and doors shall be compatible with those of the original building.

206 ii. Roof forms shall be compatible with the existing structure.

207 ~~109.~~ Building Materials

208 ~~a. The primary exterior finish material of all structures shall not consist of vinyl, aluminum~~
209 ~~or metal siding (including sheet or corrugated metal), plywood, particle board, or other~~
210 ~~products not intended as an architectural finish product.~~

211 ~~i. Stucco may be considered when it is detailed with wood trim around windows~~
212 ~~and doors. A shadow line around windows should be created.~~

213 ~~ii. A range of secondary materials including trim may be used as long as they~~
214 ~~remain secondary.~~

215 ~~iii. Wood, slate, tiles and high-quality composition shingles and shakes shall be used~~
216 ~~for roofing materials.~~

217 a. Intent. The intent of the facade materials standards of this section is to:

218 i. Provide minimum material standards to ensure use of well-tested, high quality,
219 durable surfaces, while permitting a wider range of materials for details;

220 ii. Encourage a high level of detail from smaller scaled, less monolithic materials in
221 order to relate facades to pedestrians, especially at the ground level.

222 b. Major Materials. A minimum of eighty percent (80%) of each facade, not including
223 window and door areas, shall be composed of major materials, as specified in this
224 section.

225 i. Allowed Major Materials. The following are allowed major materials.

226 a. Stone.

227 b. Brick.

228 c. Wood.

229 d. Architectural metal panel systems.

230 e. Fiber Cement board.

231 f. Glass curtain wall.

232 g. Terra cotta decorative units, tiles or panels.

233 h. Architectural cast stone including glass fiber reinforced concrete.

234 ii. Prohibited Major Materials. The following materials are prohibited as major
235 materials, unless otherwise approved under the standards of this Section:

236 a. Face-sealed EIFS synthetic stucco assemblies and decorative
237 architectural elements.

238 b. Synthetic stucco or elastomeric finishes on stucco.

239 c. Unfinished or untreated wood.

240 d. Glass block.

241 e. Vinyl or aluminum siding.

242 f. Plastic, including high-density polyethylene, polyvinyl chloride (PVC),
243 and polycarbonate, panels.

244 g. Fiberglass and acrylic panels.

245 iii. Limited Use Major Materials. The following materials are prohibited as a
246 major material except consistent with the following:

247 a. Economy Bricks. Brick types larger than three inches in height are
248 allowed as major materials on rear, alley, and rail corridor facades. In

- 249 such instances, corner bricks shall be used to give the appearance of a
250 full brick façade.
- 251 c. Minor Materials. Allowed minor materials are limited to trim, details, and other accent
252 areas that combine to twenty percent or less of the total surface of each facade.
- 253 i. Major Materials. All allowed major materials may serve as minor materials.
254 ii. Allowed Minor Materials. The following are allowed minor materials:
- 255 a. Metal for beams, lintels, trim, exposed structure, and other
256 ornamentation
- 257 b. Split-faced, burnished, glazed, or honed concrete masonry units or
258 block cast stone concrete elements.
- 259 c. Vinyl for window trim.
260 d. Cement-Based Stucco.
261 e. Face-sealed EIFS synthetic stucco assemblies and decorative
262 architectural elements.
263 f. Synthetic stucco.
- 264 d. Other Materials with Approval. Materials that are not listed in this section for its
265 proposed application as allowed major materials, limited use materials, or allowed minor
266 materials, may not be installed on any facade unless approved by the reviewing authority
267 pursuant to this subsection (d). The reviewing authority may approve facade materials
268 that are not listed in this section for its proposed application if the applicant demonstrates
269 the material in its proposed application meets the intent of the facade material standards
270 described in subsection (a) of this section. Samples and examples of successful high
271 quality local installation shall be provided by the applicant.